

# Public Document Pack

## Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Pen-y-bont ar Ogwr

### Bridgend County Borough Council



Swyddfeydd Dinesig, Stryd yr Angel, Pen-y-bont, CF31 4WB / Civic Offices, Angel Street, Bridgend, CF31 4WB

*Rydym yn croesawu gohebiaeth yn Gymraeg.  
Rhowch wybod i ni os mai Cymraeg yw eich  
dewis iaith.*

*We welcome correspondence in Welsh. Please  
let us know if your language choice is Welsh.*



Annwyl Cyngorydd,

### CYFARFOD ARBENNIG PWYLLGOR CRAFFU TESTUN 3

Cynhelir Cyfarfod Arbennig Pwyllgor Craffu Testun 3 Hybrid trwy Siambr y Cyngor, Swyddfeydd Dinesig, Stryd yr Angel, Pen-y-bont ar Ogwr / o bell Trwy Timau Microsoft ar **Dydd Mawrth, 26 Mawrth 2024 am 10:00.**

### AGENDA

1. Ymddiheuriadau am absenoldeb  
Derbyn ymddiheuriadau am absenoldeb gan Aelodau.
2. Datganiadau o fuddiant  
Derbyn datganiadau o ddiddordeb personol a rhagfarnol (os o gwbl) gan Aelodau / Swyddogion yn unol â darpariaethau'r Cod Ymddygiad Aelodau a fabwysiadwyd gan y Cyngor o 1 Medi 2008.
3. Galw Penderfyniad y Cabinet i Mewn: Defnydd Arfaethedig o Brotocol Trosoglwyddo Trafodion Tir gyda Phrifddinas-Ranbarth Caerdydd ar gyfer Tir ym Mrynmenyn a Bryncethin 3 - 28

### Gwahoddwyr:

Cyngorydd Huw David - Arweinydd y Cyngor  
Cyngorydd Rhys Goode – Aelod Cabinet dros Dai, Cynllunio ac Adfywio  
Cyngorydd Hywel Williams – Aelod Cabinet dros Gyllid, Adnoddau a Chyfreithiol

Janine Nightingale - Cyfarwyddwr Corfforaethol, Cymunedau  
Justin Kingdon - Rheolwr Grŵp Gwasanaethau Landlord Corfforaethol  
Laura Griffiths - Rheolwr Grŵp Cyfreithiol a Gwasanaethau Democraidaidd

Nodyn: Bydd hwn yn gyfarfod Hybrid a bydd Aelodau a Swyddogion mynychu trwy Siambr y Cyngor, Swyddfeydd Dinesig, Stryd yr Angel, Pen-y-bont ar Ogwr / o bell Trwy Timau Microsoft. Bydd y cyfarfod cael ei recordio i'w drosglwyddo drwy wefan y Cyngor. Os oes gennych unrhyw

Ffôn/Tel: 01656 643643

Facs/Fax: 01656 668126

Ebost/Email: [talktous@bridgend.gov.uk](mailto:talktous@bridgend.gov.uk)

Negeseuon SMS/ SMS Messaging: 07581 157014

[Twitter@bridgendCBC](https://twitter.com/bridgendCBC)

Gwefan/Website: [www.bridgend.gov.uk](http://www.bridgend.gov.uk)

Cyfnwidi testun: Rhowch 18001 o flaen unrhyw un o'n rhifau ffon ar gyfer y gwasanaeth trosglwyddo testun

Text relay: Put 18001 before any of our phone numbers for the text relay service

Rydym yn croesawu gohebiaeth yn y Gymraeg. Rhowch wybod i ni os yw eich dewis iaith yw'r Gymraeg

We welcome correspondence in Welsh. Please let us know if your language choice is Welsh

gwestiwn am hyn, cysylltwch â cabinet\_committee@bridgend.gov.uk neu ffoniwch 01656 643148 / 643694 / 643513/ 643696.

Yn ddiffuant

**K Watson**

Prif Swyddog, Gwasanaethau Cyfreithiol a Rheoleiddio, AD a Pholisi Corfforaethol

**Dosbarthiad:**

Cynghorwyr

S J Bletsoe  
N Clarke  
C Davies  
P Davies

Cynghorwyr

M J Evans  
P W Jenkins  
MJ Kearn  
W J Kendall

Cynghorwyr

J E Pratt  
G Walter  
I Williams  
MJ Williams

<b>Meeting of:</b>	<b>EXTRAORDINARY SUBJECT OVERVIEW AND SCRUTINY COMMITTEE 3</b>
<b>Date of Meeting:</b>	<b>26 MARCH 2024</b>
<b>Report Title:</b>	<b>CALL-IN OF CABINET DECISION: PROPOSED USE OF LAND TRANSACTION TRANSFER PROTOCOL WITH CARDIFF CAPITAL REGION FOR LAND AT BRYNMENYN &amp; BRYNCETHIN</b>
<b>Report Owner / Corporate Director:</b>	<b>CHIEF OFFICER – LEGAL &amp; REGULATORY SERVICES, HR &amp; CORPORATE POLICY</b>
<b>Responsible Officer:</b>	<b>MERYL LAWRENCE SENIOR DEMOCRATIC SERVICES OFFICER - SCRUTINY</b>
<b>Policy Framework and Procedure Rules:</b>	<b>The work of the Overview &amp; Scrutiny Committees relates to the review and development of plans, policy or strategy that form part of the Council’s Policy Framework and consideration of plans, policy or strategy relating to the power to promote or improve economic, social or environmental wellbeing in the County Borough of Bridgend. Any change to the structure of the Scrutiny Committees and the procedures relating to them would require the Bridgend County Borough Council Constitution to be updated.</b>
<b>Executive Summary:</b>	<p><b>A Call-In Notice has been received and following consultation with the Scrutiny Chairs, an Extraordinary meeting of Subject Overview and Scrutiny Committee (SOSC) 3 has been arranged to consider the Call In of the decision of Cabinet on 12 March 2024 in relation to the Proposed Use of Land Transaction Transfer Protocol with Cardiff Capital Region for Land at Brynmenyn and Bryncethin.</b></p> <p><b>The role of the Committee within the Call-In process is to consider the proposed decision taken by Cabinet including the reasons for the decision, factors taken into account by Cabinet when making the decision and whether the decision is in line with corporate priorities and policies.</b></p> <p><b>Following consideration of the decision, the Committee may recommend that the decision be reconsidered by</b></p>

	<p><b>the Cabinet, setting out in writing the nature of its concerns. If referred to the Cabinet, it must be reconsidered by Cabinet within a further seven clear working days, amending the decision or not, before adopting a final decision.</b></p> <p><b>If the Committee does not refer the matter back to the Cabinet, the decision may be determined on the date of the Overview and Scrutiny Committee meeting.</b></p>
--	--

## 1. Purpose of Report

- 1.1 The purpose of this report is to enable the Committee to consider the decision of Cabinet of 12 March 2024 in relation to the Proposed Use of Land Transaction Transfer Protocol with Cardiff Capital Region for Land at Brynmenyn and Bryncethin.

## 2. Background

- 2.1 In accordance with Section 7.23 of the Council's Constitution, which states that three Members of an Overview and Scrutiny Committee, and a Scrutiny Chair, are needed for a decision to be called in, a Notice of Call-In has been received from three Members and a Chair, requesting that the Executive decision made by Cabinet on the 12 March 2024 be Called-In.
- 2.2 For the purposes of informing the Committee more fully regarding the reasons for Call-In, the following appendices have been attached:
- **Appendix A** – Cabinet Decision Record of 12 March 2024;
  - **Appendix B** – Notice of Call-In Form;
  - **Appendix C** – Report of the Corporate Director Communities: Proposed Use of Land Transaction Transfer Protocol with Cardiff Capital Region for Land at Brynmenyn and Bryncethin.

## 3. Current situation / proposal

- 3.1 The role of Councillors exercising Overview and Scrutiny is, amongst other things, to ensure that the development of the Council's policies and the way they are being implemented reflect the needs and priorities of local Communities in the County Borough. As such, in holding to account the Cabinet for the efficient exercise of the executive function, the Overview & Scrutiny process aims to strengthen accountability for the decisions and performance of Bridgend County Borough Council.
- 3.2 Three Members of Overview and Scrutiny Committees and one Scrutiny Chair have requested to Call-In the Cabinet decision of 12 March 2024.
- 3.3 The role of the Committee within the Call-In process is to consider the proposed decision taken by Cabinet including the reasons for the decision, factors taken into account by Cabinet when making the decision and whether the decision is in

line with corporate priorities and policies. Details as to the reasons for Call-In are provided in the notice of Call-In at **Appendix B**.

3.4 Following consideration of the decision, the Committee may recommend that the decision be reconsidered by the Cabinet, setting out in writing the nature of its concerns. If referred to the Cabinet, it must be reconsidered by Cabinet within a further seven clear working days, amending the decision or not, before adopting a final decision. If the Committee does not refer the matter back to the Cabinet, the decision may be determined on the date of the Overview and Scrutiny Committee meeting.

#### **4. Equality implications (including Socio-economic Duty and Welsh Language)**

4.1 The equality implications are outlined in Section 4 of the Cabinet report attached as **Appendix C**.

#### **5. Well-being of Future Generations implications and connection to Corporate Well-being Objectives**

5.1 An assessment under the Well-being of Future Generations (Wales) Act 2015 has been made and is outlined in Section 5 of the Cabinet report attached at **Appendix C**.

#### **6. Climate Change Implications**

6.1 The Climate Change Implications are outlined in Section 6 of the Cabinet report attached as **Appendix C**.

#### **7. Safeguarding and Corporate Parent Implications**

7.1 There are no safeguarding or corporate parent implications arising from this report.

#### **8. Financial Implications**

8.1 The financial implications are outlined in Section 8 of the Cabinet report attached as **Appendix C**.

#### **9. Recommendation**

9.1 The Committee is asked to consider the Cabinet decision of 12 March 2024 relating to Proposed Use of Land Transaction Transfer Protocol with Cardiff Capital Region for Land at Brynmenyn and Bryncethin and to determine whether it wishes to either:

a) refer the decision back to Cabinet for reconsideration;

Or:

b) decide not to refer the matter back to the Cabinet.

#### **Background documents**

None.

This page is intentionally left blank

MINUTES OF A MEETING OF THE CABINET HELD HYBRID IN COMMITTEE ROOMS 2 AND 3 - CIVIC OFFICES, ANGEL STREET, BRIDGEND, CF31 4WB ON TUESDAY, 12 MARCH 2024 AT 14:30

Present

Councillor HJ David – Chairperson

JC Spanswick  
HM Williams

N Farr  
JPD Blundell

W R Goode

J Gebbie

Officers:

Carys Lord  
Claire Marchant  
Janine Nightingale  
Kelly Watson  
Julie Ellams  
Mark Shephard  
Lindsay Harvey  
Michael Pitman  
Anya Richards

Chief Officer - Finance, Performance & Change  
Corporate Director Social Services and Wellbeing  
Corporate Director - Communities  
Chief Officer Legal, HR and Regulatory Services  
Democratic Services Officer - Committees  
Chief Executive  
Corporate Director Education and Family Support  
Technical Support Officer – Democratic Services  
Interim Group Manager Communications and Public Affairs

Declarations of Interest

Cllr Neelo Farr declared a personal interest in item 13, Home to School/College Transport Policy

**301. Approval of Minutes**

Decision Made	The minutes of the 20/02/2024 were approved as a true and accurate record.
Date Decision Made	12 March 2024

**302. Outcome of the Consultation on the Draft Participation and Engagement Strategy**

Decision Made	Cabinet noted the outcome of the consultation and approved the Engagement and Participation Strategy attached as Appendix B to the report for publication
Date Decision Made	12 March 2024

**303. Housing And Homelessness Position Statement**

Decision Made	<p>Cabinet:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• noted the contents of the report;</li> <li>• approved the acquisition of Housing in Multiple Occupation (HMO) style properties which were within the Council’s approved capital estimates for the purpose of providing temporary accommodation subject to all reasonable due diligence and legal advice;</li> <li>• agreed to suspend the relevant parts of the Council’s Contract Procedure Rules (CPRs) with regards to the requirement to tender for a contract and delegated authority to the Head of Partnerships and Housing to enter into Service Level Agreements with existing accommodation providers for a period of ‘up to’ 12 months in order to continue the provision of additional temporary accommodation as necessary to meet the Council’s statutory duties;</li> <li>• delegated authority to the Head of Partnerships and Housing to approve the final terms of the Service Level Agreements on behalf of the Council and to arrange execution of the agreements on behalf of the Council in consultation with the Chief Officer – Legal and Regulatory, HR and Corporate Policy;</li> <li>• noted that a further report will be presented to Cabinet to update on the position regarding temporary accommodation.</li> <li>• requested that a further report on the Social Housing Grant be submitted to Cabinet.</li> </ul>
Date Decision Made	12 March 2024

**304. Local Housing Market Assessment 2024**

Decision Made	<p>Cabinet:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• approved the LHMA 2024 (Appendix 1 to the report) for submission to Welsh Government.</li> <li>• requested an update on the progress of the submission, to a future meeting.</li> </ul>
Date Decision Made	12 March 2024



**305. Non-Domestic Rates: Discretionary Relief: Retail, Leisure And Hospitality Rates Relief Scheme 2024-25**

Page 9

Decision Made	Cabinet adopted the Non-Domestic Rates Retail, Leisure and Hospitality Rates Relief Scheme for 2024-25 as detailed within Appendix A of the report.
Date Decision Made	12 March 2024

**306. Proposed Use Of Land Transaction Transfer Protocol With Cardiff Capital Region for Land At Brynmenyn & Bryncethin**

Decision Made	<p>Cabinet:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Noted the contents of this report and the statutory requirements for planning consent and various licences and permits, that sat outside of the Land Transaction Transfer Protocol.</li> <li>2. Delegated authority to Corporate Director – Communities, in consultation with the Chief Officer - Legal &amp; Regulatory Services, HR &amp; Corporate Policy and the Chief Officer, Finance, Housing &amp; Change, to draft and enter into the Option Agreement with the CCR/CJC based on the principles set out in this report, and agreed the valuation of the land and conditions.</li> <li>3. Agreed that any capital receipt received by the Council, is afforded a ring-fenced protection until such time as it is clear that the project will proceed, to ensure that there are funds available should the land be returned to the Councils ownership.</li> <li>4. Agreed that a subsequent report will be brought back to Cabinet should the Option Agreement or project not proceed, in order the land can be returned to the Council for the agreed value at which it was disposed and that a decision on the future of the two parcels of land can be agreed</li> </ol>
Date Decision Made	12 March 2024

**307. Welsh Public Library Standards**

Decision Made	Cabinet considered and noted the content of the report and Appendices 1 and 2, recognising the positive work that Bridgend's library services had delivered to date in regard to the Welsh Public Library Standards.
Date Decision Made	12 March 2024

**308. Procedure for the Appointment and Removal of Local Authority Governors**

Page 10

Decision Made	Cabinet: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• approved the procedure for the appointment and removal of local authority governors as summarised in paragraphs 3.1-3.5 and detailed in Appendix A to the report</li> <li>• approved the amendment to the Scheme of Delegation of Functions as detailed in paragraph 3.6.</li> <li>• agreed that details of the applicants should be anonymised.</li> </ul>
Date Decision Made	12 March 2024

**309. Appointment Of Local Authority Governors**

Decision Made	Cabinet approved the appointments detailed at paragraph 3.1 of the report.
Date Decision Made	12 March 2024

**310. Schools Admissions Policy 2025-2026**

Decision Made	Cabinet approved the Schools Admissions Policy 2025-2026 at Appendix A to the report.
Date Decision Made	12 March 2024

**311. Home-To-School/College Transport Policy**

Decision Made	Cabinet approved a 12-week consultation on the following proposals: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Withdrawal of legacy transport for all learners benefitting from an identified and available (safe) walking route to school, to fall in line with the statutory distances of two miles for primary school-age pupils and three miles for secondary school-age pupils.</li> </ul>
---------------	---

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Removal of legacy 'sibling' protection for pupils.</li> <li>• Removal of all transport for nursery pupils (excluding pupils attending their nearest suitable Welsh-medium or faith school).</li> <li>• Removal of all Post-16 transport excluding pupils attending the following schools:             <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>o Ysgol Gyfun Gymraeg Llangynwyd;</li> <li>o Archbishop McGrath Catholic High School; and</li> <li>o The Bishop of Llandaff Church in Wales High School.</li> </ul> </li> <li>• The offer to parents/carers of pupils with ALN the option of a 'personal transport budget' providing a mileage allowance of 45p per mile.</li> </ul>
Date Decision Made	12 March 2024

**312. Information Report for Noting**

Decision Made	Cabinet acknowledged the publication of the report referred to in paragraph 3.1 of the report.
Date Decision Made	12 March 2024

**313. Cabinet, Council And Overview And Scrutiny Committees Forward Work Programmes**

Decision Made	Cabinet: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Approved the Cabinet Forward Work Programme for the period 1 March 2024 to 30 June 2024 at Appendix 1;</li> <li>• Noted the Council and Overview and Scrutiny Committees' Forward Work Programmes for the same period, as shown at Appendix 2 and Appendix 3 of the report, respectively.</li> </ul>
Date Decision Made	12 March 2024

314. Urgent Items

Page 12

Decision Made	None
Date Decision Made	12 March 2024

To observe further debate that took place on the above items, please click [this link](#)

The meeting closed at 17:44.

**Notice of 'Call-In'**

**Committee:** Overview & Scrutiny Committee

**1. Decision Subject To Call-In:**

Proposed Use Of Land Transaction Transfer Protocol With Cardiff Capital Region for Land At Brynmenyn & Bryncethin:

**Decision Date:** 12<sup>th</sup> March 2024, **Decision Notice Date:** 13<sup>th</sup> March 2024.

**2. Member(s) of the Committee Wishing to Call the Decision In**

<b>Name</b>
Cllr Freya Bletsoe – Chair Scrutiny Committee 2
Cllr Ian Spiller
Cllr Tim Thomas
Cllr Martin Williams

**3. Reasons for the Call-In**

Various reasons as listed below:

- The report presented to cabinet did not contain sufficient information for Cabinet to make a fully informed decision nor did they seek additional information through questioning. There are significant concerns about the soundness of their decision.
  - The Land Transfer Protocol applies to 'surplus' land. The paper did not adequately prove nor did the cabinet seek evidence that the parcels of land in question are actually 'surplus' or how this conclusion was arrived at.
    - For example, during the recent budget scrutiny process officers advised that all land and property was subject to a review to identify opportunities for consolidation, repurposing or disposal by lease or sale/transfer. It would be expected that the outcome of this process would be available to support the claim that the land is surplus. The land in question could be used for any number of purposes to support BCBC operations. To a member of the public it could be considered that the decision to designate the land as surplus is predetermined as a means of transferring to CCRD as opposed to being as a result of a robust and transparent review. The cabinet should have explored this further to assure themselves that the land is actually surplus.
    - The paper didn't state whether or not there had been any third party approach for the land either for a commercial sale or for a community use. For example, until recently Bryncethin RFC had planning consent on part of the land in question (Clay Pits). Therefore, it does suggest that there may be other third-party interest in the land which has not been considered or therefore weighed against the land transfer to CCRD.
    - There is no evidence that alternative uses have been explored.

- The cabinet paper states that the transferred land can only be used for an operational purpose and expressly forbids any speculative use. The CCRD by its very nature is a speculative organisation. It loans to and invests in third party organisations and projects on a speculative basis to generate economic benefit and financial return. In this instance CCRD will be using the land to invest in a speculative commercial arrangement with Marubeni, a multinational company whose primary purpose is to deliver profits to its shareholders. The cabinet failed to question whether this is a proper operational purpose under the legislation. The cabinet also failed to question the proposed commercial arrangement between CCRD, Marubeni and any other potential partners to satisfy themselves that the land transfer is in fact lawful. The CCRD (future Joint Committee) has no inherent 'operational purpose' for holding land in the sense that the Act intended. Its primary purpose is commercial speculation and as such the cabinet should have commissioned independent legal advice and deferred its decision pending this.
- The cabinet stressed that this decision would retain the land in public ownership. This may be strictly true but is also disingenuous. Public ownership implies for public use or benefit. In the event that the land is transferred to CCRD then it will be made available to Marubeni a commercial entity who will use the land to generate a profit. CCRD would only receive a 15% stake in the hydrogen project therefore 85% would be held by other partners who may not be public bodies or have the public interest at heart. It is not clear if the land will form part of the 15% stake. This transfer does not protect the land for public use as the wider public would understand that phrase.
- The transfer agreement states that if the project does not proceed then the land will be offered back to BCBC but there was no clarity regarding what will happen to the land if the project succeeds then fails or when the production of hydrogen ends at some future point.
- No consideration has been made of alternative means of land transfer such as lease or open market disposal.
- There has been no consideration as to whether the BCBC could re-engage with the project with the contribution of land acting as an equity stake. This could secure a long term revenue stream.
- The cabinet has failed to consider the public interest and indeed the strong local opposition to the scheme. Transferring the land for this purpose without consultation with local residents and businesses is not aligned with the principles of the Future Generations and Wellbeing Act. There will be considerable alarm that following the cabinet's decision to withdraw from the project that the project is potentially proceeding under a different guise without local influence and control. The impact upon residents wasn't referenced let alone considered.
- Given that planning and other permissions have yet to be granted notwithstanding any other concerns this decision is premature. Given all of the protections and caveats that have been included regarding specific land used and the ringfencing of funds until and IF planning consent is granted it would surely have been more appropriate to defer this decision until AFTER consents and permissions were obtained.
  - The report notes that there are revenue costs associated with the valuation of the land and its transfer. Would it not therefore be

prudent for transfer to be suspended until after all consents and permissions were obtained to mitigate against abortive costs. It must be recognised that there have already been significant abortive costs expended on this scheme. Why are BCBC expected to meet these costs in any case?

- The differential in estimated land value of £1,000k and £250k with and without planning consent is a concern. Given that the enhanced value and completion of the land transfer is dependent on a successful planning application, should the cabinet have considered that in making this decision at this time they may have inadvertently placed pressure on the Development Control Committee?
- Given the issues outlined above there is a real risk that this decision could leave the council open to future legal challenge.
- The decision has not been properly considered and requires further scrutiny.

**4. Date of Call-In:** 19<sup>th</sup> March 2024

This page is intentionally left blank



<b>Meeting of:</b>	<b>CABINET</b> <b><u>APPENDIX C</u></b>
<b>Date of Meeting:</b>	<b>12 MARCH 2024</b>
<b>Report Title:</b>	<b>PROPOSED USE OF LAND TRANSACTION TRANSFER PROTOCOL WITH CARDIFF CAPITAL REGION FOR LAND AT BRYNMENYN &amp; BRYNCETHIN</b>
<b>Report Owner / Corporate Director:</b>	<b>CORPORATE DIRECTOR COMMUNITIES</b>
<b>Responsible Officer:</b>	<b>JANINE NIGHTINGALE CORPORATE DIRECTOR COMMUNITIES</b>
<b>Policy Framework and Procedure Rules:</b>	<b>The transfer of land via an options agreement to the Cardiff Capital Region City Deal (CCR), at a jointly agreed red book valuation will be undertaken under the provision of the Land Transaction Transfer Protocol.</b>
<b>Executive Summary:</b>	<p><b>This report summarises the proposal to use an Options Agreement arrangement with the Cardiff Capital Region City Deal (CCR), under the Land Transaction Transfer Protocol. This will enable CCR to have an option to purchase surplus local authority land at Brynmenyn and Bryncethin, subject to conditions and red book valuation.</b></p> <p><b>The report outlines the conditions that are required to be satisfied to protect the Council's interests , including that a joint agreed Red Book valuation is used for the transfer, based on a planning permission being determined favourable, that the land remains in public sector ownership, can only be used for the intended planning purpose, that the land is offered back to the Council at the value it was transferred if the project does not proceed and that all finances are in place for the transfer.</b></p> <p><b>The report recommends delegating authority to Corporate Director – Communities, in consultation with the Chief Officer - Legal &amp; Regulatory Services, HR &amp; Corporate Policy and the Chief Officer, Finance, Housing &amp; Change, to draft &amp; execute the agreement when all conditions are duly met.</b></p>

**1. Purpose of Report**

- 1.1 The report will outline the proposed use of an Options Agreement arrangement with the Cardiff Capital Region City Deal (CCR), under the Land Transaction Transfer Protocol. If agreed, this will enable CCR to have an option to purchase surplus local authority owned land at Brynmenyn and Bryncethin, subject to conditions and red book land valuation.

**2. Background**

- 2.1 In September 2023, the Cabinet made the difficult decision to withdraw from the Hybont Green Hydrogen Project with CCR, Welsh Government and Marubeni Europower Limited (MEL). This was due to the Council's challenging Medium Term Financial Strategy (MTFS) and inability to meet the significant financial commitments required to complete due diligence, including financial, technical and legal also an inability to meet the timescale for the project. It was agreed by Cabinet that the Council would continue dialogue with partners including Welsh Government and for them to identify an alternative route forward with MEL.
- 2.2 Since the withdrawal of BCBC from the project, CCR is now considering being a key partner and investor in the project and is currently applying the rigours of due diligence and reviewing the business case and investment potential. CCR's interest in this green hydrogen project is borne from the likelihood it will be a key part of the energy mix, as they aim to decarbonise the Southeast Wales industrial economy and it could also provide investment and job creation in the local economy.
- 2.3 The project will be subject to several variables being in place such as planning permission and operators licensing and permitting, these are discussed from paragraph 2.7 below. However, what is key, is the availability of investment from CCR to make the project deliverable and the appropriate land on which to develop the project itself. The availability of land is the subject of this Cabinet Report and the use of the Land Transaction Transfer Protocol (LTTP) to enable an Options Agreement to be put in place to enable CCR to purchase the surplus BCBC land, subject to several conditions being met.
- 2.4 Before the use of the LTTP is examined in detail, it is considered beneficial to outline the planning, operating licences and permitting processes that are also needed to be in place to allow this project to progress.

**Planning Permission**

- 2.5 The development of any facilities for the Hybont Project, including a solar array at the Claypits in Bryncethin and the Green Hydrogen production and a filling station at land at Brynmenyn, will require planning consent. The Local Planning Authority, part of BCBC, would determine an application of this scale by presenting it to the Development Control Committee (DCC), made up of cross party elected members. This committee will receive a detailed Planning Officers report with a recommendation to either grant or refuse permission, based on whether the use of

the land is deemed appropriate. The development control committee can only make decision on land use and cannot make decisions on areas such as the safety of the production or operations. These are subject to separate licence and permit agreements. It is likely that this Hybont Project planning application will be determined at a Special Planning Committee in late April, subject to all the appropriate detailed information being submitted by the applicant.

- 2.6 The Welsh Government has also reserved the right to “Call In” the application for a decision to be made by Ministers. Once the planning officers report is completed with a recommendation in place, this will be sent to Planning and Environmental Decisions Wales (PEDW) Officers for consideration. If they do not wish to “call in” the application, then the DCC can continue to determine the application, or grant any permission subject to confirmation from PEDW that they do not wish to “call in”. However, should they wish to “call in” the application then it will be determined nationally by PEDW and Welsh Government and their decision will then override any decision that has been taken locally.

### Licences and Permits

- 2.7 Hydrogen production, storage, and transportation is very heavily regulated in the UK and the Hybont Project will require approval and a wide range of permits and Licences in place, to be able to safely operate, produce and store green hydrogen for the project. The range of statutory regulators that are involved in granting these permits and licences include the Health & Safety Executive (HSE), Natural Resources Wales (NRW), The Coal Authority, Welsh Water and the National Grid.
- 2.8 The Council is the Hazardous Substances Authority and as such has responsibility for granting a Control of Hazardous Substance License. However, the Council’s role is administrative in nature, in that it is for the two statutory consultees, HSE and NRW, to agree if it is appropriate for a hazardous substance licence to be approved. Only when the agreement from these two regulators is in place, will the Development Control Committee, grant this licence.
- 2.9 The operating team within MEL are working through the other permits and licences that will be required for the Hybont Project currently with the appropriate statutory regulators. These are not the responsibility of the Council and do not affect our ability to continue with the LTTP. Whilst not an exhaustive list, the following sets out major permits, licences, or permissions that will be required: -
- **Coal Authority Permit from the Coal Authority** – This permit allows work to be undertaken on land that is considered as a potential coal risk. It requires submission of risk assessments and method statements to ensure compliance with Coal Authority requirements.
  - **Control of Major Accident Hazards Consent (COMAH) from the Health and Safety Executive** – This consent is a set of legal requirements that aim to prevent and mitigate the effects of major accidents that involve hazardous substances. The regulations apply to all businesses that handle or store large quantities of

hazardous substances in the UK. The regulations require businesses to assess the risks associated with their activities and to take measures to prevent or reduce the likelihood of a major accident occurring. Businesses are also required to have an emergency response plan in place in case of a major accident. It is broken down into two tiers: Upper Tier: 50 tonnes and Lower Tier 5 tonnes. The HyBont facility is not expected to require classification as either a lower-tier or upper-tier COMAH site.

- **Environmental Permit from Natural Resources Wales** – This permit authorises an industrial facility operator to carry out activities that have the potential to cause pollution or harm to the environment or increase flood risk. The purpose of an environmental permit is to ensure that the activities are carried out in a way that protects the environment and human health and it will set out specific conditions that the operator must comply with such as emission limits, monitoring requirements and reporting obligations.
- **Trade Effluent Consent from Welsh Water** – This is legal permission that allows the hydrogen production site to discharge liquid waste or effluent from their premises into the public sewer system. The water company will assess the application and set appropriate limits and conditions for the discharge of the effluent to ensure discharges are appropriate.
- **Permission to work within Vicinity of Water Main from Welsh Water** – This permission granted by Welsh Water will permit construction, maintenance, or repair work to be carried out near their water mains or infrastructure to ensure protection of assets.
- **NGED Grid Connection Agreement G99 from National Grid** - This agreement is required for power generators to connect on the National Grid Electricity Distribution network as per Electricity Networks Association Engineering Recommendation G99.

### **3. Current situation / proposal**

- 3.1 We now turn to the subject of this Cabinet Report, which is the proposed use of an Options Agreement arrangement with the Cardiff Capital Region City Deal (CCR), under the Land Transaction Transfer Protocol. If agreed, this will enable CCR to have an option to purchase surplus local authority owned land, subject to conditions and an agreed red book valuation.
- 3.1 The Land Transaction Transfer Protocol is considered best practice guidance for the disposal and transfer, of land and property assets between publicly funded bodies in Wales that are identified as “surplus.” It is the responsibility of the relevant public body to determine whether the land is “surplus,” but it will generally be the case if the

land does not meet any of the following criteria:

- it is currently used/required to deliver BCBC's operational functions.
- there is a clearly evidenced plan to use the land to deliver BCBC's future operational functions.
- it is held for commercial purposes and/or is integral to continuity of service delivery.
- the land is vital for business contingency.

3.3 The two areas of land subject to this LTTP are, first a 17.47 hectares (43.18 acre) site of rough grazing land at Bryncethin, known locally as the Clay Pits , with its boundary shown as red in Appendix A. The second area is a 1.72 hectares (4.24 acres) site of undeveloped and unmanaged land with a Local Development Plan industrial use designation and is immediately adjacent to the Brynmenyn Industrial Estate, with its boundary shown as red at Appendix B. Both sites are in BCBC ownership, are vacant, have no plans for future development or business continuity and are declared surplus. For these reasons the use of the Protocol for the purposes of a Options Agreement for a proposed disposal of the land to CCR is considered an acceptable mechanism legally for proceeding.

3.4 There are a number of key principles that need to be followed with the Protocol. The first is that the organisations involved, that is the Council and CCR, should commission an independent valuation report to settle the price to be paid and to value assets at market value, in accordance with Royal Institute of Chartered Surveyors (RICS) standards. The Council will agree that the value of the land will be determined by the red book protocol. In simple terms, a Red Book valuation involves a RICS Registered Valuer assessing the land and providing a formal report of the current market value of the property. The current estimated value of the two parcels of land with the benefit of planning permission being in place, is circa £1 million. The Option Agreement would need to contain this valuation mechanism whereby both parties jointly agree the valuation in accordance with the Protocol after the last of the conditions has been satisfied and the Option notice has been served.

3.5 Another principle of the LTTP is that it should be used for the transfer of land/property to meet an operational requirement and not a speculative purpose. The Protocol states that, if a public body identifies land as being surplus to requirements, best practice requires that property which is formally declared as surplus should be disposed of as expeditiously as possible. However, it does acknowledge that consideration should be given to the longer- term in respect of planning use and the fact that the longer-term benefits may outweigh the costs savings of a quick turnaround. In this case, the proposed Option Agreement falls into the latter category

where the land will have a considerably higher value once planning permission is obtained. It is proposed that the Option Agreement will be conditional upon planning permission for the Hydrogen Demonstrator Project being determined favourably and that it would only be exercised should this be the case. This also supports the Protocol's condition that the land will be used for an operational requirement, rather than being acquired with no specific purpose in mind.

- 3.6 However, it should be recognised that once the land has been transferred to CCR there is no restriction on the land that prevents it from being used for any other purpose and there would be no obligation on CCR to build out in accordance with the planning permission. The Council will impose such a restriction on use in the Option Agreement and it is proposed that this includes a restriction that the land can only be used for the intended purpose of the planning consent. This may impact on the market value, but it does protect the interests of the Council. In addition, there will be a provision in the Option Agreement that should the project not proceed, or the land no longer be required, then it must be offered back to the Council at the value at which it was transferred. This is to ensure that the land stays within public sector ownership and is not passed onto a private sector user.
- 3.7 Internal transfers of land within the public sector, should not normally involve claw-back or overage but it may be appropriate in certain circumstances to include a clawback provision in transfers between public bodies outside the same accounting umbrella. The Protocol refers to the UK Government's Cabinet Office which recommends that unrestricted market value transfers would not normally include a requirement for any clawback provision from one public sector body to another. This is not the case with the proposed option agreement with CCR, as there will be conditions that protect the Council's interest with regard to the land remaining within public sector ownership, the use of the land being only for the purposes of the planning consent and that the land value will be based on the land having an approved planning consent in place. Therefore, the Council will reserve the right to include an overage or claw back provision in the Options Agreement, should it be deemed necessary at the time of entering the Agreement, to protect its interests.
- 3.8 A further provision in the Protocol, is that there should be an approved business case in place for the land acquisition with the confirmed availability of funding. A Strategic Outline Case ("SOC") was presented to the CCR investment panel in November 2023, which was supportive of the recommendation for a proposed equity investment from CCR in return for a 15% shareholder stake in the project to deliver the Hydrogen Demonstrator Project. Following on from that approval, there will now be a more detailed analysis by CCR, in order to develop a Full Business Case, which is intended to be approved at the first meeting of the newly formed Corporate Joint Committee in May 2024. In addition, Department of Energy Security and Net Zero (DESNZ) funding from UK Government has been awarded to the project, which enables the green

hydrogen to be distributed at a viable price to off-takers and thus removes the risk that was outlined in the SOC.

- 3.9 There are still funding risks associated with the project with regard to specific legal and commercial considerations, aligned to the involvement of the Japanese Government through its New Energy and Industrial Technology Development Organisation (“NEDO”) and that, if there is a material delay in planning permission being obtained or changes are necessitated to the scheme then this could impact on the finance ask. In these circumstances, if planning permission is not granted within the timescales proposed, there is a risk that funding at the level required for the Project to proceed from NEDO may not be achieved. If this was the case, and the project ceased, then dependent on timeframe, either the land Option Agreement would not be exercised from the Council to CCR or the condition in the Options Agreement for the land to be passed back to the Council would be exercised.
- 3.10 The final point of note from the protocol is that it is recommended that an acquiring organisation ensures they have the power to hold property assets prior to engaging and that all public bodies must ensure that every action taken is within its powers or it may be challenged as unlawful. The Cardiff City Region City Deal is transferring into a Corporate Joint Committee (CJC) on the 1<sup>st</sup> of April 2024 and will have the power to hold property assets, so this will not present an issue.
- 3.11 It is noted from the narrative above that the Land Transaction Transfer Protocol is a robust mechanism for allowing surplus land holdings to move from one public sector body to another, at an agreed valuation. It is clear, that there are a number of conditions that will be needed within the Options Agreement to protect the interests of the Council. Including in summary, the following: -
- That a jointly agreed Red Book valuation is used for the transfer, based on a planning permission being determined favourable, to ensure best consideration for the land.
  - That the land remains in public sector ownership and cannot be transferred or disposed of to a third party or private sector organisation.
  - That the land is only used for the intended purpose of the planning consent.
  - That should the project not proceed, the land will be offered back to the Council at the value at which it was transferred under the protocol.
  - That agreement in principle can be given to the option agreement, subject to a Full Business Case (FBC) approval from CJC in May 2024 and confirmation that funding is in place for the land transfer at the jointly agreed red book valuation.

3.12 Once the Option Agreement is in place, the transfer of the land can only take place once CCR/CJC have served an Option Notice on the Council, the timing of which is at the discretion of the CCR/CJC, unless a condition is agreed regarding the timescale for the service of the Option Notice.

#### **4. Equality implications (including Socio-economic Duty and Welsh Language)**

4.1 The protected characteristics identified within the Equality Act, Socio-economic Duty, and the impact on the use of the Welsh Language have been considered in the preparation of this report. As a public body in Wales the Council must consider the impact of strategic decisions, such as the development or the review of policies, strategies, services, and functions. It is considered that there will be no significant or unacceptable equality impacts as a result of this report.

#### **5. Well-being of Future Generations implications and connection to Corporate Well-being Objectives**

5.1 The Well-being of Future Generations (Wales) Act 2015 Assessment based on the 5 ways of working and any requisite mitigating measures have been set out below: -

- *Long-term:* The proposed Hybont project was intended to test a new green hydrogen technology for delivering net zero carbon energy, as a key part of the Council's 2030 Net Zero Carbon Strategy. It is also part of the UK and Welsh Government vision for a hydrogen energy economy and would contribute to the Government target of producing 5GW of hydrogen by 2030. The transfer of land for the project will contribute to this national agenda.
- *Prevention:* The transfer of the land at best consideration for the green hydrogen project would deliver carbon footprint reductions, preventing further harm to the environment and protecting the environment for future generations. The 2030 strategy will now be reviewed to assess the impact of this decision.
- *Integration:* The transfer of the land for the project, should planning permission be secured, would bring the development of a solar array and a supply of green electricity to the land adjacent to the Council's Bryncethin Depot. There will be opportunities for the Council to learn lessons from this best practice and look to further its own environmental objectives with regard to renewable energy.
- *Collaboration:* The transfer would be undertaken through the Land Transaction Transfer Protocol with our public sector partners Cardiff Capital Region City Deal (CCR), who will shortly become a Corporate Joint Committee (CJC). This will ensure that best consideration and value is achieved for the land and that it remains within public sector ownership.
- *Involvement:* The long-term future direction of the project will be dependent on the continued collaboration of Welsh Government and the CJC with Marubeni Europower Limited, now that BCBC can no longer be involved. However, the transfer of the land to our public sector partners will ensure that best consideration



and value is achieved for the land and that it remains within public sector ownership.

## **6. Climate Change Implications**

- 6.1 The proposed transfer of the land to CCR/CJC is for a use that will bring forward the generation of green electricity via a proposed solar array on the Clay Pits site and the production of green hydrogen on the site at Brynmenyn. Both parts of this project, if planning consent is approved and all the statutory licences and permits agreed, will be seen to benefit the climate change agenda.

## **7. Safeguarding and Corporate Parent Implications**

- 7.1 There are no safeguarding or corporate parent implications arising from this report.

## **8. Financial Implications**

- 8.1 There are two areas for financial consideration, arising from this report. The first is the revenue costs associated with preparing the joint valuation report and the options agreement. These will be funded from a budget allocation within Corporate Landlord for asset disposals.

- 8.2 The second area is the expected capital receipt for the value of the land, currently estimated at circa £1 million, with the benefit of a favourable planning permission in place. As set out above, this must be jointly agreed and prepared via an independent Red Book Valuation as described in paragraph 3.4 above. The Options Agreement will not be exercised until all the conditions as set out in paragraph 3.11 above are satisfied. In addition, should the land not be required for the project, then it will be offered back to the Council at the value at which it was transferred. This will protect the Council's financial interests moving forward and ensure that the land remains in public sector ownership. It is also recommended that any capital receipt received by the Council is afforded a ring-fenced protection until such time as it is clear that the project will proceed, to ensure that there are funds available should the land be returned to the Councils ownership.

## **9. Recommendations**

- 9.1 It is recommended that Cabinet:
1. Note the contents of this report and the statutory requirements for planning consent and various licences and permits, that sit outside of the Land Transaction Transfer Protocol.
  2. Delegate authority to Corporate Director – Communities, in consultation with the Chief Officer - Legal & Regulatory Services, HR & Corporate Policy and the Chief Officer, Finance, Housing & Change, to draft and enter into the Option Agreement with the CCR/CJC based on the principles set out in this report, and agree the valuation of the land and conditions.

3. Agree that any capital receipt received by the Council, is afforded a ring-fenced protection until such time as it is clear that the project will proceed, to ensure that there are funds available should the land be returned to the Councils ownership.
4. Agree that a subsequent report will be brought back to Cabinet should the Option Agreement or project not proceed, in order the land can be returned to the Council for the agree value at which it was disposed and that a decision on the future of the two parcels of land can be agreed.

### **Background documents**

19<sup>th</sup> September 2023 Cabinet Paper – Hybont Project Gateway Review

14<sup>th</sup> June 2022 Cabinet Paper – Bridgend Net Zero Carbon – Hydrogen Technology Demonstrator

Appendix A – Land at the Clay Pits in Bryncethin



**Appendix B – Land at Brynmenyn**

NOTES

Scale at A1 1:500

Do not scale from drawing & all dimensions are in meters.

All levels are in metres and relate to AOD (ordnance survey)

Red line is site boundary

